

City of York Council

Resolutions and proceedings of the Meeting of the City of York Council held in the Citadel, Gillygate, York on Thursday, 22 March 2018, starting at 6.30pm.

Present: The Lord Mayor (Cllr Barbara Boyce) in the Chair, and the following Councillors:

Acomb Ward

Bishopthorpe Ward

K Myers
S Barnes

Clifton Ward

Copmanthorpe Ward

D Myers
Wells

Carr

Dringhouses & Woodthorpe Ward

Fishergate Ward

Fenton
Reid

D'Agorne
D Taylor

Fulford and Heslington Ward

Guildhall Ward

Aspden

Craghill
Flinders
Looker

Haxby & Wigginton Ward

Heworth Ward

Cuthbertson
Gates
Richardson

Boyce
Funnell
Williams

Heworth Without Ward

Holgate Ward

Ayre

Cannon
Derbyshire
K Taylor

Hull Road Ward

Huntington and New Earswick
Ward

N Barnes
Shepherd

Orrell
Runciman

Micklegate Ward

Osbaldwick and Derwent Ward

Crawshaw
Kramm

Brooks
Warters

Rawcliffe and Clifton Without Ward

Rural West York Ward

Dew
Lisle
Rawlings

Gillies
Steward

Strensall Ward

Westfield Ward

Doughty
Douglas

Hunter
Waller

Wheldrake Ward

Mercer

Apologies for absence were received from Councillors Galvin, Mason, Pavlovic, Cullwick, Hayes and Jackson.

67. Declarations of Interest

Members were invited to declare at this point in the meeting any personal interests not included on the Register of Interests, any prejudicial interests or any disclosable pecuniary interests they might have in the business on the agenda.

The following **personal** interests were declared:

<u>Councillor</u>	<u>Agenda Item</u>	<u>Description of Interest</u>
Douglas	5 – Report of Executive Leader and Executive Recommendations and Questions 6 – Report of Deputy Leader and Questions	SASH (Homelessness Charity) volunteer

The following **prejudicial or disclosable pecuniary** interests were declared:

<u>Councillor</u>	<u>Agenda Item</u>	<u>Description of Interest</u>
Flinders	9 – Report of the Executive Member	Employed by Network Rail (references to York Central site in the report)

68. Minutes

Resolved: That the minutes of the Council meeting held on 14 December 2017, the Budget Council Meeting held on 22 February 2018 and the Extraordinary Meeting held on 08 March 2018 be approved and then signed by the Lord Mayor as the correct record.

69. Civic Announcements

No civic announcements were made by the Lord Mayor.

70. Public Participation

Two members of the public had registered to speak at the meeting under Public Participation.

Bill Clayton spoke in relation to the third motion on notice listed in item 7 of the agenda (*Raising Awareness of Myalgic Encephalomyelitis in York*). He supported the idea of York leading the way in caring for those with the illness which is not well understood.

Gwen Vardigans addressed the Council in relation to the York Hospital. She highlighted her concerns in relation to the impact of a limited company running the cleaning, catering and maintenance services in York Teaching Hospital.

71. Report of Executive Leader and Executive Recommendations and Questions

A. Executive Leader's report

A written report on the work of the Executive was received from the Executive Leader, Councillor Gillies. He also provided a verbal update on the work undertaken by him over the past week.

Members were then invited to question Councillor Gillies on his report and questions were received from the floor from the following Members in relation to the subjects listed:

- Councillor Williams – new Leader's priorities during the upcoming administration;
- Councillor Kramm – the affordability of housing in York;
- Councillor S Barnes – what attempts had been made to bring the Secretariat of East Cost Mainline Authorities to York;

- Councillor Craghill – new Leader’s plans to manage the co-ordination of work between different parts of the Council (e.g. planning enforcement and other departments);
- Councillor Derbyshire – new Leader’s views on the Local Plan given the proposed housing numbers in York;

Councillor Gillies responded directly to all the questions put to him, including supplementaries.

B. Executive Recommendations

Future Operation of Rowntree Park Lodge and Park

Cllr Gillies moved and Cllr Waller seconded the following recommendation contained in Minute 116 of the Executive held on 25 January 2018:

“Recommended: That Council approve the allocation of £150,000 capital budget to facilitate the regeneration of the upper floors of Rowntree Park Lodge, to be funded from the revenue receipts generated from future use of the Lodge.

Reason: To support Rowntree Park and its stakeholders in developing the facilities for a long term sustainable future.”

On being put to the vote, the recommendation was declared CARRIED and it was

Resolved: That the above recommendation in respect of the *Future Operation of Rowntree Park Lodge and Park* be approved.

Investment at Lincoln Court to Create an Independent Living with Support Facility

Cllr Gillies moved and Cllr Waller seconded the following recommendation contained in Minute 149 of the Executive held on 15 March 2018:

“Recommended: That the estimated £1.4m gross cost of the Lincoln Court capital investment be added to the Capital Programme, with the costs to be funded from the Housing Revenue Account investment reserve, recycled right to buy receipts, other Housing capital receipts and capital held by the Older Persons’ Accommodation Programme.

Reason: To secure the long term future of Lincoln Court and ensure that it can continue to provide good quality accommodation for older people, while also expanding the capacity to provide community support and care from this location.”

On being put to the vote, the recommendation was declared CARRIED and it was

Resolved: That the above recommendation in respect of the *Investment at Lincoln Court to Create an Independent Living with Support Facility* be approved.

James House Temporary Homeless Accommodation – Approval for Budget Revisions and Authorisation to Appoint the Successful Contractor

Cllr Gillies moved and Cllr Waller seconded the following recommendation contained in Minute 150 of the Executive held on 15 March 2018:

“Recommended: That Council approve the revised budget of £12.4m for the James House project, financed from £2.451m Homes England grant and £9.949m from the Housing Revenue Account (investment reserve, capital receipts and commuted sums), thereby ensuring no increase in cost to the council.

Reason: To enable the construction contract for the new homeless accommodation at James House to be awarded, £2.451m Homes England grant funding to be claimed, and a start on site achieved by 29 March 2018.”

On being put to the vote, the recommendation was declared CARRIED and it was

Resolved: That the above recommendation in respect of the *James House Temporary Homeless Accommodation – Approval for Budget Revisions and Authorisation to Appoint the Successful Contractor* be approved.

72. Report of Deputy Leader and Questions

A written report was received from Councillor Waller, the Deputy Leader, on his portfolio area.

Members were then invited to question Councillor Waller on his report and questions were received from the floor from the following Members in relation to the subjects listed:

- Councillor Warters – whether the City of York Streetscape Strategy and Guidance would remain part of the Local Plan and whether the City of York Council would be following the guidelines in that document;

- Councillor Craghill – whether the review of green open space would incorporate the city centre and urban areas and what the timescales in relation to that matter would be;
- Councillor Shepherd – proposals relating to enforcement action in respect of fly-tipping;
- Councillor D Myers – missed refuse collection issues caused by harsh weather conditions and timescales of collection during adverse weather.

Councillor Waller responded directly to all the questions put to him, including supplementaries.

73. Motions on Notice

Motions submitted for consideration directly by Council, in accordance with Standing Order 22.1.

(i) York’s Gender Pay Gap and an Inclusive Growth Plan

(Proposed by Councillor Looker and seconded by Councillor S Barnes)

“Council notes:

- That the gap in average weekly wages between men and women in York has widened from £33 in 2010 to £117 in 2017.
- In 2017, men in York earned 21% more than women, while men earned 16.8% more than women nationally.

Council also notes data showing York is the most unequal city in the north of England and the ninth most unequal city in the UK[1].

Despite the growing gender pay gap, the city has no strategy for ‘Inclusive Growth’.

Whilst many cities in the region have developed focussed plans and strategies to address income inequalities, including the gender pay gap, York has not.

Council resolves to request the Executive to receive and consider a full report, including options and a recommendation, at a future meeting, on its approach to addressing the gender pay gap and other income inequalities. To properly inform that report and Executive decision making, Officers should be asked to:

1. bring forward a review of the gender pay gap and broader income inequalities in York, including an overview of the data and any understanding or interpretation of the underlying causes or contributory factors;
2. undertake a review of inclusive growth plans/ strategies being deployed by other local authorities in the region and elsewhere in the country to consider their type, differences of approach and efficacy;
3. consider the costs and benefits of developing and effectively resourcing an overarching, coordinated plan or strategy for inclusive growth in York's economy."

[1] <http://www.centreforcities.org/city/york/>

On being put to the vote, the motion was declared CARRIED and it was

Resolved: That the motion, as set out above, be approved.

(ii) Fly Tipping

(Proposed by Councillor Gates, seconded by Councillor Richardson)

“Council notes:

- Residents' concerns about fly tipping, which many believe have worsened since Labour closed Beckfield Lane tip;
- Efforts to call attention to fly tipping by the newly launched #crime not to care campaign which council fully supports;
- Acknowledgement that the vast majority of residents and businesses fully comply with the spirit and letter of the law but that it is being abused by a minority;
- The frontline, listening focus of the coalition and a desire amongst residents that they should be able to dispose of rubbish more easily.

Therefore council requests that officers bring a paper to the Executive looking at how extra efforts to minimise fly tipping can be introduced, including increased use of public and covert CCTV cameras at frequently used fly tipping spots, increased fines and increased co-operation with neighbouring councils.

Council also requests the paper include an analysis of how bulky collection and other waste costs can be lowered for residents.”

Councillor Gates agreed to accept the amendment put forward by Councillor Warters, which was as follows:

- To the end of the first bullet point, **add** *'and many also believe is encouraged by charging York council tax payers at Hazel Court and Towthorpe tips to dispose of small amounts of building waste from domestic projects'*.
- In the final sentence of the motion: after *'bulky collection'*, **delete** *'and other waste costs'* and **insert** *'charges'*; and after *'can be lowered for residents'*, **insert** *'and the charges for disposal of domestic building waste and domestic bonded asbestos scrapped altogether, to encourage responsible disposal of such materials and reduce the financial burden to the council tax payer of dealing with the fly tipping of such material'.*

Councillor Gates agreed to accept an amendment put forward by Councillor Fenton, which was as follows:

- In the fourth bullet point, after *'able to'* and before *'dispose'* **insert** *'responsibly'* .
- At the end of the paragraph ending *'neighbouring councils'* **add** the following sentence, *'This paper should also consider what more could be done to raise awareness of the need to reduce waste being created in the first place, and opportunities to re-use unwanted items'*.
- At the end of the last paragraph, after *'lowered for residents'*, **add** the following sentence, *'It should also include an assessment of the affordability of providing replacement recycling boxes to residents free of charge.'*

At that point in the meeting, Councillor D'Agorne withdrew his amendment, which was as follows:

- In the first bullet point **delete** *'which many believe have worsened since Labour closed Beckfield Lane tip;'* and **insert** *'and the increasing cost to the council of removing fly tipping.'*

Councillor N Barnes then moved and Councillor Williams seconded a further amendment, which was as follows:

- To the end of the first bullet point, **add:** *' , however, two years later, fly tipping reports were over 300 down on the year it closed;'*
- After the second bullet point, **insert** a new third bullet point, as follows:
 - *'That Liberal Democrat and Conservative Coalition councillors voted down Labour's efforts through the budget two years running, to reduce fly tipping by halving the cost of bulky waste collections;'*
- In the final bullet point: **delete** *'frontline, listening focus of the'* and **insert** *'belated wish of the Conservative-Liberal Democrat';* and after *'coalition'*, **insert** *'to act on fly tipping'*.
- In the final sentence of the motion: after *'how'*, **insert** *'Labour's half price proposal for';* after *'bulky'*, **insert** *'waste';* after *'collection'*, insert *'would operate';* after *'and'* **insert** *'how'.*

On being put to the vote, this amendment was declared LOST.

A vote was then taken on the original motion, as altered by both Councillor Warters' and Councillor Fenton's amendments, which was CARRIED. It was

Resolved: That the original motion, as altered by Councillor Warters' and Councillor Fenton's amendments, be approved as set out below:

“Council notes:

- Residents' concerns about fly tipping, which many believe have worsened since Labour closed Beckfield Lane tip **and many also believe is encouraged by charging York council tax payers at Hazel Court and Towthorpe tips to dispose of small amounts of building waste from domestic projects;**
- Efforts to call attention to fly tipping by the newly launched #crime not to care campaign which council fully supports;
- Acknowledgement that the vast majority of residents and businesses fully comply with the spirit and letter of the law but that it is being abused by a minority;
- The frontline, listening focus of the coalition and a desire amongst residents that they should be able to **responsibly** dispose of rubbish more easily.

Therefore council requests that officers bring a paper to the Executive looking at how extra efforts to minimise fly tipping can be introduced, including increased use of public and covert CCTV cameras at frequently used fly tipping spots, increased fines and increased co-operation with neighbouring councils. **This paper should also consider what more could be done to raise awareness of the need to reduce waste being created in the first place, and opportunities to re-use unwanted items.**

Council also requests the paper include an analysis of how bulky collection **charges** can be lowered for residents **and the charges for disposal of domestic building waste and domestic bonded asbestos scrapped altogether, to encourage responsible disposal of such materials and reduce the financial burden to the council tax payer of dealing with the fly tipping of such material. It should also include an assessment of the affordability of providing replacement recycling boxes to residents free of charge.**”

(iii) Raising Awareness of Myalgic Encephalomyelitis in York

(Moved by Councillor Runciman on behalf of Councillor Cullwick, seconded by Councillor Aspden)

Note: Councillor Runciman sought the Council’s consent to alter the motion slightly, by inserting the words *‘to ask the Chief Executive’* after *‘Council resolves’* in the second paragraph.

“Council notes:

- That Myalgic Encephalomyelitis (M.E.) is a chronic, neurological condition that causes symptoms affecting many body systems to an estimated 250,000 people in the UK and around 17 million people worldwide.
- That many sufferers report the process of diagnosis can take many months, or even years, and that patients often highlight a lack of awareness among clinicians about the condition and possible treatments.
- That M.E remains a ‘hidden’ disease and largely remains out of the public conscience and much more is needed, both in York and across the UK,

to raise awareness of the disease and our understanding of it.

- The excellent work of the Yorkshire Fatigue Clinic in providing both assessments and vital assistance to those experiencing symptoms of M.E.
- The considerable efforts of the York M.E Community in offering a support network for those suffering from M.E in York and for also continuously working to raise awareness on the disease.

Council resolves **to ask the Chief Executive:**

- To use the Council's 'city lights' to light up landmarks such as the City Walls and West Offices on International M.E Awareness Day, due 12th May 2018.
- To initiate a communications campaign, utilising the Council's distribution and communication networks to generate awareness of M.E in York, allowing York to lead a national debate on the subject.
- That the York ME Community be invited to run an awareness raising session for all Councillors, so that they are better informed about the effects of this hidden disease."

Councillor Runciman agreed to accept an amendment put forward by Councillor D'Agorne, which was as follows:

- Under '*Council resolves*' in the second bullet point, after '*generate awareness of ME*' insert '*within the council and*'

- Under '*Council resolves*' **add** the following fourth bullet point:
 - *'That training and awareness sessions are provided for staff and partners of CYC at supervisory level and above to ensure that they are able to provide appropriate support for employees suffering from ME.'*

A vote was then taken on the original motion, as altered by Councillor D'Agorne's amendment, which was CARRIED. It was

Resolved: That the original motion, as altered by Councillor D'Agorne's amendment, be approved as set out below:

"Council notes:

- That Myalgic Encephalomyelitis (M.E.) is a chronic, neurological condition that causes symptoms affecting many body systems to an estimated 250,000 people in the UK and around 17 million people worldwide.
- That many sufferers report the process of diagnosis can take many months, or even years, and that patients often highlight a lack of awareness among clinicians about the condition and possible treatments.
- That M.E remains a 'hidden' disease and largely remains out of the public conscience and much more is needed, both in York and across the UK, to raise awareness of the disease and our understanding of it.
- The excellent work of the Yorkshire Fatigue Clinic in providing both assessments and vital assistance to those experiencing symptoms of M.E.

- The considerable efforts of the York M.E Community in offering a support network for those suffering from M.E in York and for also continuously working to raise awareness on the disease.

Council resolves to ask the Chief Executive:

- To use the Council's 'city lights' to light up landmarks such as the City Walls and West Offices on International M.E Awareness Day, due 12th May 2018.
- To initiate a communications campaign, utilising the Council's distribution and communication networks to generate awareness of M.E **within the council and** in York, allowing York to lead a national debate on the subject.
- That the York ME Community be invited to run an awareness raising session for all Councillors, so that they are better informed about the effects of this hidden disease.
- **That training and awareness sessions are provided for staff and partners of CYC at supervisory level and above to ensure that they are able to provide appropriate support for employees suffering from ME.'**

(iv) Community Wealth Building

(Proposed by Councillor D Myers, seconded by Councillor Derbyshire)

“Council recognises community wealth building as a place-based approach to economic regeneration that empowers local government and enables communities to create and

retain more wealth locally.

Council notes research by the Centre for Local Economic Strategies (CLES), published by the Federation of Small Businesses, showing that for every pound spent with a small or medium-sized firm, 63p is re-spent locally. This figure drops to 40p for large or multinational companies.

Council resolves to request the Executive:

- commission council officers to identify York's key anchor institutions and begin discussions with them on the possibility of a city-wide approach to using procurement to spend locally wherever possible;
- commission research for York, similar to that undertaken by Joseph Rowntree Foundation and Leeds City Region, which identifies the amount of money that is removed from the local area through public sector spending on goods and services, in order to inform a wider strategic approach to community wealth building in York.

On being put to the vote, the motion was declared CARRIED and it was

Resolved: That the motion, as set out above, be approved.

74. Questions to the Leader or Executive Members

In accordance with Standing Order 20, Members were invited to question the Leader and/or the Executive Members in respect of any matters within their portfolio responsibility.

Questions were received from the floor from the following Members in relation to the subjects listed:

- (i) To Councillor Gillies, Leader:
- From Councillors Carr and S Barnes (supplementary) – reasons for reinstating two Members to Executive and the new Leader’s role in the process.
- (ii) To Councillor Aspden, Executive Member for Economic Development & Community Engagement:
- From Councillor Orrell – clarification on progress in relation to Local Plan in York in view of the UK Government’s comments.
- (iii) To Councillor Dew, Executive Member for Transport & Planning:
- From Councillor Williams – declining standards of road conditions in York and actions of current administration to tackle that problem in light of national cuts.
- (iv) To Councillor K Myers, Executive Member for Education, Children & Young People:
- From Councillors Brooks and Derbyshire (supplementary) – update on the bomb threats recently received by schools, particularly on communication and supporting schools in case of emergency;
 - From Councillor K Taylor – impact of the increased class sizes in York secondary schools on disadvantaged pupils and school staff;
 - From Councillor Crawshaw – opportunities for additional funding to close the attainment gap in York and the region.

The Leader and Executive Members responded directly to all the questions put to them, which included supplementary questions.

75. Report of Executive Member

Council received a written report from Councillor Waller, Executive Member for Environment. Councillor Waller moved and Councillor Aspden seconded acceptance of the report and it was

Resolved: That the report of the Executive Member for Environment be received and noted.

Members were then invited to question Councillor Waller on his report and questions were received from the floor from the following Members in relation to the subjects listed:

- Councillors Looker, Craghill (supplementary) and Warters (supplementary) – querying whether separation of recyclable material would be maintained after opening of Allerton Park, when the new lorries would be introduced to facilitate the operation and whether there were ways to improve the overall recycling system in York;
- Councillor Reid – ways for residents and businesses to get involved in the Clean Air Day 2018 in York;
- Councillor D’Agorne – timescales and resources needed to address the issues of the highway drainage blockage.

Councillor Waller responded directly to all the questions put to him, including supplementary questions.

76. Scrutiny - Report of the Chair of the Customer and Corporate Services Scrutiny Management Committee

Council received the report of the Chair of the Customer and Corporate Services Scrutiny Management Committee on the work of the Committee since the last report to Council in December 2017. Councillor Williams moved and Councillor Cannon seconded the acceptance of the report and it was

Resolved: That the scrutiny report be noted.

77. Pay Policy 2018/19

Consideration was given to a written report detailing the Council's Pay Policy Statement for 2018/19 relating to the pay of the Council's senior staff, to fulfil the requirements of Sections 38 – 43 of the Localism Act 2011. Councillor Gillies moved and Councillor Waller seconded a motion to approve the Policy Statement.

On being put to vote, the motion was declared CARRIED and it was

Resolved: (i) That the motion in respect of the Pay Policy Statement for 2018/19 be approved.

(ii) That the fact that the Annex A reflected the Chief Officer structure in existence at the time of adoption of the Policy be noted.

Reason: In order to fulfil the requirements of Sections 38 – 43 of the Localism Act 2011 for the Council to produce and publish an annual policy statement that covers a number of matters concerning the pay of the Council's senior staff, principally the Chief Officers and relationships with the pay of the rest of the workforce.

78. Proportionality, Allocation to Seats and Appointments to the Council Structure and Outside Bodies for the Remainder of 2017-18

Council considered a report setting out details of the proposed new arrangements in relation to a number of recent changes affecting both the political make-up of the Council and the leadership as well as membership of the Executive. The report sought formal approval for new proportionality arrangements and resulting changes to appointments, to enable the Council to run its business for the remainder of the 2017/18 Municipal Year.

Councillor Gillies moved and Councillor Waller seconded the recommendations. On being put to vote, the recommendations were declared CARRIED and it was

Resolved: (i) That the revised allocation of seats in accordance with Annex 1 of the report be approved.

(ii) That the appropriate nominations to Committees, other bodies and outside bodies as well as appointments to Chairs and Vice-Chairs, as set out in Annex B of the report, together with details of any further appointments which may be circulated prior to the meeting, be approved.

Reason: To fulfil the Council's statutory and constitutional requirements.

Cllr Barbara Boyce
LORD MAYOR OF YORK

[The meeting started at 6.30pm and concluded at 9.40pm]